





Allameh Tabataba'i University

Faculty of Persian Literature & Foreign Languages

Department of English Translation Studies

Strategies of Official and Non-official Subtitles

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in English Translation Studies.

By: Zeinab Nasrollahi

Advisor: Dr. Gholam-Reza Tajvidi

Reader: Dr. Hussein Mollanazar

Tehran, Iran

July 2011

فرم گردآوری اطلاعات پایان نامه ها

کتابخانه مرکزی دانشگاه علامه طباطبایی

عنوان: راهبردهای زیرنویس های رسمی و غیررسمی
نویسنده / محقق: زینب نصرالهی
مترجم: -
استاد راهنما: دکتر غلامرضا تجویدی استاد مشاور / استاد داور: دکتر حسین ملانظر / دکتر فرزانه فرحزاد
کتابنامه: دارد واژه نامه: ندارد
نوع پایان نامه: بنیادی <input type="checkbox"/> توسعه ای <input type="checkbox"/> کاربردی <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
مقطع تحصیلی: کارشناسی ارشد سال تحصیلی: ۱۳۸۹-۹۰
محل تحصیل: تهران نام دانشگاه: علامه طباطبایی دانشکده: ادبیات فارسی و زبانهای خارجی
تعداد صفحات: xiv+217+XI گروه آموزشی: مترجمی زبان انگلیسی
کلید واژه ها به زبان فارسی: ترجمه چندرسانه ای، ترجمه دیداری-شنیداری، دوبله زیرنویسی، راهبردهای زیرنویسی، زیرنویس های رسمی، زیرنویس های غیر رسمی، مترجم زیرنویس، راهبردهای ترجمه، راهبردهای زیرنویس
کلید واژه ها به زبان انگلیسی: Multimedia Translation, Audiovisual Translation, Dubbing, Subtitling, Subtitling Strategies, Official Subtitles, Non-official Subtitles, Translation Strategy, Subtitling Strategies

چکیده

الف. موضوع و طرح مسئله (اهمیت موضوع و هدف):

در دنیایی که متون چندرسانه‌ای تفوق خود را بر متون نوشتاری تثبیت می‌کنند، اهمیت وجود پژوهش‌های مربوط به انواع این نوع متون انکارناپذیر است. زیرنویس‌ها به عنوان یکی از انواع متون چندرسانه‌ای در جامعه امروز ایران با اقبال روزافزونی مواجه شده‌است. این نوع ترجمه هم توسط افراد، بصورت مستقل، و هم در استودیوهای رسمی، تحت نظارت وزارت فرهنگ و ارشاد اسلامی، صورت می‌پذیرد. لذا، در این تحقیق سعی شده به راهبردهای بکار رفته در این دو شیوه از زیرنویس پرداخته شود.

ب. مبانی نظری شامل مرور مختصری از منابع، چارچوب نظری و پرسش‌ها و فرضیه‌ها

در این تحقیق با استفاده از رویکردی توصیفی (DTS) و همینطور با بکارگیری مدل ارائه شده توسط گاتلیب (۱۹۹۲) سعی شده تا پرسامدترین راهبردهای بکار رفته در هریک از این دو شیوه از زیرنویس مشخص شود. همچنین به جهت میسر ساختن تحلیل نهایی این راهبردها تحت ۵ دسته که از علم معانی باستان برگرفته شده‌است، طبقه بندی شده‌اند.

پ. روش تحقیق شامل تعریف مفاهیم، روش تحقیق، جامعه‌ی مورد تحقیق، نمونه‌گیری و روش‌های

نمونه‌گیری، ابزار اندازه‌گیری، نحوه‌ی اجرای آن، شیوه گردآوری و تجزیه و تحلیل داده‌ها:

پیکره تحقیق حاضر، شامل ۹ فیلم زیرنویس شده است که بین سالهای ۲۰۰۰ تا ۲۰۰۹ تولید شده‌اند. انتخاب این فیلمها بر اساس موجود بودن آنها در هر دو نسخه رسمی و غیر رسمی بوده‌است. با انتخاب ۲۰٪ سوم از متن انگلیسی، ۱۵۷۵۰ کلمه از متن انگلیسی و ۴۰۶ دقیقه از هردو متن زیرنویس شده رونویسی شد و سپس با رویکردی توصیفی و مقایسه‌ای راهبردهای هریک مشخص گردید.

ت. یافته‌های تحقیق

در این تحقیق ۶۱۹۷ راهبرد مشخص گردید. این راهبردها که تحت ۵ گروه اصلی دسته بندی شده بودند نشان دادند که گروه اصلی Repetitive در هر دو شیوه از زیرنویس پرسامدتر از سایر گروه‌ها بود.

ث. نتیجه گیری تحقیق

با توجه به نتایج به دست آمده از یافته‌های این تحقیق مشخص گردید که علی‌الرغم اینکه راهبردهای متفاوتی در یک پاره زبانی-دیداری-شنیداری بکار رفته است، اما هردو شیوه از زیرنویس تقریباً از یک الگو استفاده می‌کنند، در عین حال تفاوت‌های اندکی ملاحظه گردید که می‌تواند ناشی از یک سری اصول زبانی و فرازبانی باشد که نیازمند تحقیقات بیشتر است.

صحت اطلاعات مندرج در این فرم بر اساس محتوای پایان نامه و ضوابط مندرج در فرم را گواهی می‌نمایم.

نام استاد راهنما: دکتر غلامرضا تجویدی

سمت علمی: دانشیار

نام دانشکده: ادبیات فارسی و زبان های خارجی

رئیس کتابخانه:



Allameh Tabataba'i University

Faculty of Persian Literature & Foreign Languages

Department of English Translation Studies

Strategies of Official and Non-official Subtitles

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in English Translation Studies.

By: Zeinab Nasrollahi

Advisor: Dr. Gholam-Reza Tajvidi

Reader: Dr. Hussein Mollanazar

Examiner: Dr. Farzaneh Farahzad

Tehran, Iran

July 2011

Dedicated to

My Loving Mother

who is Everything to me,

Anything...

Acknowledgments

All gratitude and praise is due to God, the Almighty, who bestowed upon me the willingness to learn, and by whose grace I had the chance to study at Allameh Tabataba'i University where I had the opportunity to appreciate and value Translation Studies through the inspiration of Department's professors.

First of all, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to *Dr. Gholam-Reza Tajvidi* for his sagacious ideas and insightful comments from the very early stages of this research. He has made every effort to enhance the quality of this work and patiently provided me with unflinching support and encouragement in various ways. Without his immeasurable hints and invaluable suggestions this thesis could not be completed. I owe him a really sincere "Thank You" among the many other things that I should thank him for.

I also wish to extend thanks to *Dr. Hussein Mollanazar*, the Chair of English Translation Studies, both for his reading of and commenting on the present work and also his unending helps and support during my course of study.

My heartfelt thanks also go to *Dr. Farzaneh Farahzad* who kindly accepted to read and evaluate this research. It is a great advantage to have the opportunity to be judged fairly and judiciously.

I am also in debt of *Professor Gottlieb, Dr. Díaz Cintas* and *Mr. Arrechi* for providing me with useful articles from which I benefitted in this research.

Last, but certainly not the least, I wish to express my heartfelt gratitude to my family, who strongly supported me all through my college years. I feel particularly indebted to them for providing me with constant encouragement to complete this research.

Abstract

Conducted within the DTS framework, following a comparative model of research, this thesis' main concern was around the two trends of subtitling in Iran- official and non-official - and determining the strategies applied to these ends. To help the identification of the strategies, Gottlieb's (1992) model was used as the fundamental model, which provided a strong starting point to detect the strategies. In this study, a total of 6197 strategies were detected. In order to facilitate the analytical process all the strategies were put under five main categories, of which *Repetitio* was the most frequent one in both versions. *Detractio* was the second frequently applied category and *Transmutatio* registered the third rank. *Adiectio* was the 4th frequently used category in official subtitles and the least frequently used in non-official ones. *Substitutio* as the least frequent category of official subtitles was the 4th frequent one in non-official subtitles.

Based on the findings of this research, though different strategies are applied to an audiovisual linguistic segment, it was inferred that the two trends of subtitling in Iran follow almost the same path of normative behavior. However, some minor differences were observed which might be an outcome of a set of linguistic and extra-linguistic features that calls for further investigations.

Table of Contents

Dedication.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Abstract.....	iii
Table of Contents.....	iv
List of Figures	x
List of Tables	xii
List of Abbreviations	xiv
CHAPTER ONE.....	1
1.0. Overview	2
1.1. Introduction	2
1.2. Background of the Problem.....	3
1.3. Statement of the Problem	4
1.4. Significance of the Study	5
1.5. Purpose of the Study.....	6
1.6. Research Questions	7
1.7. Theoretical Framework	7
1.8. Definition of Key Terms	9
1.9. Operational Definition of Subtitling Strategy	11
1.10. Scope and Delimitations of the Study	12
CHAPTER TWO.....	15
2.0. Overview	16
2.1. Multimedia Translation	16
2.2. Audiovisual Translation	19
2.2.1. AVT as a Form of Translation	21
2.2.2. Types of Language Transfer Method in AVT.....	23
2.2.2.1. Luyken et al.'s Typology	24
2.2.2.2. Gambier's Typology	24
2.2.2.3. Baker and Hochel's Typology	26
2.2.2.4. Karamitroglou's Typology.....	27
2.3. Main Types of AVT	28
2.3.1. Revoicing	28
2.3.1.1. Voice-over.....	29
2.3.1.2. Narration	30

2.3.1.3.	Free commentary	30
2.3.2.	Dubbing	31
2.3.3.	Subtitling	32
2.4.	Subtitling vs. Dubbing.....	33
2.4.1.	Dubbing Constraints and Preferences	35
2.4.2.	Subtitling Constraints and Preferences	39
2.4.3.	Summary	44
2.5.	Subtitling in Focus.....	46
2.5.1.	History	46
2.5.1.1.	Practical Perspective	46
2.5.1.2.	Theoretical Perspective	49
2.5.2.	Types of Subtitling	53
2.5.2.1.	Linguistic Perspective	53
2.5.2.2.	Technical Perspective	54
2.5.2.3.	Further Types	55
2.5.3.	The Core Peculiarities of Subtitling	57
2.5.3.1.	Change of Medium.....	62
2.5.3.2.	Reduction	64
2.5.3.3.	Synchronicity with Audiovisual Elements.....	66
2.5.4.	Subtitling Quality	67
2.5.4.1.	Technical Factors	69
2.5.4.1.1.	Spatial Parameters/ Layout.....	69
2.5.4.1.2.	Temporal Parameters.....	71
2.5.4.1.3.	Punctuation	72
2.5.4.1.4.	Text Editing	74
2.5.4.2.	Linguistic Factors	76
2.5.4.3.	Extra-linguistic Factors	83
2.5.5.	Translation Difficulties in Subtitling	85
2.5.5.1.	Clichés of Emotion.....	85
2.5.5.2.	Culture Specific Items (CSIs)	86
2.5.5.3.	Humour	89
2.5.5.4.	Pun	90
2.5.5.5.	Slang and Dialect	91

2.5.5.6.	Swearwords	92
2.5.6.	Subtitling and Other Research Areas	93
2.5.6.1.	Censorship and Subtitling	94
2.5.6.2.	Culture and Subtitles	95
2.5.6.3.	Fansubs.....	97
2.5.6.4.	Subtitling as a Learning Tool.....	99
2.5.6.5.	Subtitling for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing (SDH) and Audio-Description.....	101
2.6.	Subtitling in Iran.....	102
2.6.1.	History of the Practice.....	103
2.6.2.	Empirical Studies	105
2.6.2.1.	Culture and Subtitles	107
2.6.2.1.1.	Manipulation as a Result of Ideology	107
2.6.2.1.2.	Domestication and Foreignization.....	109
2.6.2.2.	Translation Difficulties in Persian Subtitles	110
2.6.2.2.1.	Allusion	110
2.6.2.2.2.	Collocation	112
2.6.2.2.3.	CSIs	113
2.6.2.2.4.	Humour.....	114
2.6.2.2.5.	Idioms	115
2.6.2.3.	In Search of Subtitling Strategies	116
2.6.2.3.1.	Common Subtitling Strategies.....	116
2.6.2.3.2.	Cartoons' Subtitling Strategies.....	118
2.6.2.3.3.	Omission.....	119
2.6.2.3.4.	Explicitation	120
2.6.2.3.5.	Implication	121
2.6.2.4.	Subtitling Norms in Iran	122
2.6.2.5.	Relevance Theory and Subtitles.....	124
2.6.2.6.	Pedagogical Implication of Subtitles	125

CHAPTER THREE	127
3.0. Overview	128
3.1. Introduction	128
3.2. Kind of Research	129
3.3. The Corpus	130
3.3.1. English Component	130
3.3.2. Persian Component	131
3.3.3. Size of the Corpus	132
3.3.4. Rationale.....	133
3.4. Instruments	134
3.5. Procedures	134
3.5.1. Data Collection Procedures.....	135
3.5.1.1. Unit of Analysis	136
3.5.2. Data Sheet	136
3.6. Data Classification	139
CHAPTER FOUR	140
4.0. Overview	141
4.1. Research Findings	141
4.1.1. Spy Game	141
4.1.1.1. Synopsis	141
4.1.1.2. Examples from Spy Game	142
4.1.1.3. Spy Game Statistics	143
4.1.2. Lord of the Rings: The Two Towers (LOTR)	145
4.1.2.1. Synopsis	145
4.1.2.2. Examples from LOTR	145
4.1.2.3. LOTR Statistics.....	146
4.1.3. Constantine	148
4.1.3.1. Synopsis	148
4.1.3.2. Examples from Constantine	148
4.1.3.3. Constantine Statistics	149
4.1.4. V for Vendetta.....	152
4.1.4.1. Synopsis	152
4.1.4.2. Examples from V for Vendetta	152
4.1.4.3. V for Vendetta Statistics	153
4.1.5. Mission: Impossible III	155
4.1.5.1. Synopsis	155
4.1.5.2. Examples from M:I:III	156

4.1.5.3.	M:I:III Statistics	157
4.1.6.	Eragon	159
4.1.6.1.	Synopsis	159
4.1.6.2.	Examples from Eragon	159
4.1.6.3.	Eragon Statistics.....	160
4.1.7.	I am Legend.....	162
4.1.7.1.	Synopsis	162
4.1.7.2.	Examples from I am Legend	163
4.1.7.3.	I am Legend Statistics	163
4.1.8.	Eagle Eye.....	165
4.1.8.1.	Synopsis	165
4.1.8.2.	Examples from Eagle Eye	166
4.1.8.3.	Eagle Eye Statistics	167
4.1.9.	Transformers: Revenge of the Fallen.....	169
4.1.9.1.	Synopsis	169
4.1.9.2.	Examples from Transformer	169
4.1.9.3.	Transformer Statistics	170
4.2.	Data Analysis and Results	172
4.2.1.	Repetitio Strategies	174
4.2.1.1.	Transfer	174
4.2.1.2.	Imitation	175
4.2.1.2.1.	Transliteration.....	176
4.2.1.2.2.	Borrowing.....	176
4.2.1.2.3.	Repercussion.....	177
4.2.1.3.	Transcription	177
4.2.2.	Adiectio Strategies	178
4.2.2.1.	Addition	179
4.2.2.2.	Expansion.....	181
4.2.2.3.	Bifurcation	182
4.2.2.4.	Duplication.....	182
4.2.2.5.	Completion.....	183
4.2.3.	Detractio Strategies	183
4.2.3.1.	Deletion	184
4.2.3.2.	Condensation.....	186
4.2.3.3.	Decimation	187
4.2.3.4.	Obliteration	188
4.2.3.5.	Incompletion	188

4.2.4. Transmutatio Strategies.....	189
4.2.4.1. Dislocation	190
4.2.4.2. Conversion	191
4.2.4.3. Deacronymization	192
4.2.4.4. Justification	192
4.2.5. Substitutio Strategies.....	193
4.2.5.1. Paraphrase	194
4.2.5.2. Resignation.....	195
4.2.5.3. Modification.....	195
CHAPTER FIVE	198
5.0. Overview	199
5.1. Restatement of Research Questions	199
5.2. Conclusions	200
5.2.1. Repetitio	200
5.2.2. Detractio	201
5.2.3. Transmutatio.....	202
5.2.4. Adiectio	202
5.2.5. Substitutio.....	203
5.3. Pedagogical Implications	204
5.4. Suggestions for Further Research.....	206
REFERENCES	208
APPENDICES	I
Appendix I: Figure of <i>Repetitio</i> Categories.....	II
Appendix II: Figure of <i>Adiectio</i> , <i>Detractio</i> Counterparts	III
Appendix III: Figure of <i>Transmutatio</i> and <i>Substitutio</i> Categories.....	IV
Appendix IV: Frequency and Percentage of Official Subtitling Strategies	V
Appendix V: Frequency and Percentage of Non-Official Subtitling Strategies	VI
Appendix VI: Total Frequency and Percentage of Subtitling Strategies	VII
Appendix VII: Distribution of Subtitling Strategies and Their Sub-Categories	VIII
Appendix VIII: Distribution of Official Subtitling Main Categories.....	X
Appendix IX: Distribution of Non-official Subtitling Main Categories	XI

List of Figures

Figure 2.1. Luyken et al.'s Typology of AVT.....	24
Figure 2.2. Gambier's Typology of AVT.....	25
Figure 2.3. Baker and Hochel's Typology of AVT.....	27
Figure 2.4. Karamitroglou's Typology of AVT.....	28
Figure 2.5. Dubbing Constraints.....	37
Figure 2.6. Dubbing Preferences.....	39
Figure 2.7. Subtitling Constraints.....	42
Figure 2.8. Subtitling Preferences.....	44
Figure 2.9. Semiotic Composition of Subtitling.....	59
Figure 2.10. Scheme of Potential Translational Relationships between a Source Film and a Target Film.....	61
Figure. 2.11. Relationship between Basic Components of the Subtitled Text.....	62
Figure 2.12: Diagonal Subtitling: from Foreign Language to Domestic Writing.....	63
Figure 4.1. Frequency of Spy Game's Main Categories.....	144
Figure 4.2. Percentage of Spy Game's Main Categories.....	144
Figure 4.3. Frequency of LOTR's Main Categories.....	147
Figure 4.4. Percentage of LOTR's Main Categories.....	147
Figure 4.5. Frequency of Constantine's Main Categories.....	151
Figure 4.6. Percentage of Constantine's Main Categories.....	151
Figure 4.7. Frequency of V for Vendetta's Main Categories.....	154
Figure 4.8. Percentage of V for Vendtta's Main Categories.....	154
Figure 4.9. Distribution of M:I:III's Main Categories.....	158
Figure 4.10. Percentage of M:I:III's Main Categories.....	158
Figure 4.11. Frequency of Eragon's Main Categories.....	161
Figure 4.12. Percentage of Eragon's Main Categries.....	161
Figure 4.13. Frequency of I am Legend's Main Categories.....	164
Figure 4.14. Percentage of I am Legend's Main Categories.....	164

Figure 4.15. Frequency of Eagle Eye’s Main Categories.....	168
Figure 4.16. Percentage of Eagle Eye’s Main Categories.....	168
Figure 4.17. Frequency of Transformer’s Main Categories.....	171
Figure 4.18. Percentage of Transformer’s Main Categories.....	171
Figure 4.19. Frequency of Subtitling Main Categories.....	173
Figure 4.20. Frequency of Subtitling Main Categories.....	173
Figure 4.21. Frequency of Repetitio Strategies.....	174
Figure 4.22. Frequency of Adiectio Strategies.....	179
Figure 4.23. Frequency of Detractio Strategies.....	184
Figure 4.24. Frequency of Transmutatio Strategies.....	189
Figure 4.25. Frequency of Substitutio Strategies.....	193

List of Tables

Table 2.1. Technical Factors of Subtitling	75
Table 2.2. Gottlieb’s Model of Subtitling Strategies	82
Table 3.1. List of English Component	131
Table 3.2. List of Persian Component.....	132
Table 3.3. Word Count and Duration of the Movies	133
Table 3.4. Main Categories and Sub-categories of Subtitling Strategies	137
Table 3.4.1. Deletion and Addition subcategories	138
Table 3.5. Sample Table of Itemized Strategies	138
Table 3.6. Sample Table of Distribution of Main Categories and Strategies	139
Table 3.6.1. Sample Table of Distribution of Sub-Categories.....	139
Table 4.1. Examples from Spy Game	142
Table 4.2. Distribution of Spy Game’s Main Categories and Strategies	143
Table 4.2.1. Distribution of Spy Game’s Sub-Categories	145
Table 4.3. Examples from LOTR.....	146
Table 4.4. Distribution of LOTR’s Main Categories and Strategies	146
Table 4.4.1. Distribution of LOTR’s Sub-Categories.....	147
Table 4.5. Examples from Constantine	148
Table 4.6. Distribution of Constantine’s Main Categories and Strategies.....	150
Table 4.6.1. Distribution of Constantine’s Sub-Categories	151
Table 4.7. Examples from V for Vendetta	152
Table 4.8. Distribution of V for Vendetta’s Main Categories and Strategies....	154
Table 4.8.1 Distribution of V for Vendetta’s Sub-Categories	155
Table 4.9. Examples from M:I:III	157
Table 4.10. Distribution of M:I:III’s Main Categories and Strategies.....	157
Table 4.10.1. Distribution of M:I:III’s Sub-Categories	158
Table 4.11. Examples from Eragon	159
Table 4.12. Distribution of Eragon’s Main Categories and Strategies	161
Table 4.12.1. Distribution of Eragon’s Sub-Categories.....	162
Table 4.13. Examples from I am Legend.....	163

Table 4.14. Distribution of I am Legend’s Main Categories and Strategies	164
Table 4.14.1. Distribution of I am Legend’s Sub-Categories	165
Table 4.15. Examples from Eagle Eye.....	166
Table 4.16. Distribution of Eagle Eye’s Main Categories and Strategies	167
Table 4.16.1. Distribution of Eagle Eye’s Sub-Categories	168
Table 4.17. Examples from Transformers	169
Table 4.18. Distribution of Transformers’ Main Categories and Strategies.....	170
Table 4.18.1. Distribution of Transformers’ Sub-Categories	171
Table 4.19. Distribution of Subtitling Main Categories	173
Table 4.19.1. Distribution Repetitio Strategies.....	174
Table 4.19.1.1. Distribution of Imitation Sub-Categories	175
Table 4.19.2. Distribution of Adiectio Strategies	178
Table 4.19.2.1. Distribution of Addition Sub-Categories	179
Table 4.19.3. Distribution of Detractio Strategies	184
Table 4.19.3.1. Distribution of Deletion Sub-categories	185
Table 4.19.4. Distribution of Transmutatio Strategies.....	189
Table 4.19.4.1. Distribution of Dislocation Sub-categories.....	190
Table 4.19.5. Distribution of Substitutio Strategies.....	193
Table 4.19.5.1. Distribution of Paraphrase Sub-categories	194
Table 4.19.5.4. Distribution of Modification Sub-categories	196

Abbreviations

Adj.	Adjective
AVT	Audiovisual Translation
CD	Compact Disk
CSI	Culture Specific Items
DTS	Descriptive Translation Studies
DVD	Digital Versatile Disk
F	Frequency
IRIB	Islamic Republic of Iran Broadcasting (Organization)
MMT	Multimedia Translation
N	Noun
O	Object
PC	Personal Computer
Subj.	Subject
SDH	Subtitling for the Deaf and Hard of Hearings
SL	Source Language
ST	Source Text
TL	Target Language
TS	Translation Studies
TT	Target Text
V	Verb

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction