



Allameh Tabataba'i University
Faculty of Persian Literature & Foreign Languages
Department of English Translation Studies

Hybridity in Subtitling

A Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in
Translation Studies

Approved and Evaluated by the Thesis Committee:

Advisor: Dr. Hussein Mollanazar

Reader: Dr. Gholamreza Tajvidi

Examiner: Dr. Farzaneh Farahzad

Researcher: Mahbubeh Khalili

Tehran, September 2011

فرم گردآوری اطلاعات پایان‌نامه‌ها
کتابخانه مرکزی دانشگاه علامه طباطبائی

عنوان: التقاط زبانی و فرهنگی در زیرنویس فیلم	
نویسنده/محقق: محبوبه خلیلی	
مترجم: ...	
استاد راهنما: دکتر حسین ملانظر	
استاد مشاور: دکتر غلامرضا تجویدی	
استاد داور: دکتر فرزانه فرحزاد	
کتابنامه: دارد	واژه‌نامه: ندارد
نوع پایان‌نامه: <input type="checkbox"/> بنیادی <input type="checkbox"/> توسعه‌ای <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> کاربردی	
مقطع تحصیلی: کارشناسی ارشد	سال تحصیلی: 90-89
محل تحصیل: تهران	
نام دانشگاه: علامه طباطبائی	
نام دانشکده: ادبیات فارسی و زبانهای خارجی	
تعداد صفحات: $x + 176$	
گروه آموزشی: مترجمی زبان انگلیسی	
کلید واژه‌ها به زبان فارسی: ترجمه سمعی- بصری، زیرنویس، متن التقاطی	
کلید واژه‌ها به زبان انگلیسی:	
Audiovisual translation, Subtitling, Hybrid text	

چکیده

الف. موضوع و طرح مسئله (اهمیت موضوع و هدف): دنیای امروز امکانات زیادی را برای برقراری ارتباط در اختیار افراد قرار می‌دهد که در این میان صنعت فیلم از ابزارهایی است که به شدت این ارتباط جهانی را تحت تأثیر قرار می‌دهد. این روزها افراد علاقمند زیادی هستند که برای باخبر شدن از حال و اوضاع ساکنین دیگر نقاط جهان، فیلم می‌بینند؛ زیرا فیلم در عین حال که سرگرم‌کننده است، می‌تواند اطلاعات زیادی را در اختیار بیننده‌اش قرار دهد. در این میان، فیلم‌های زیرنویس‌شده به زبان مقصد طرفداران خاص خود را دارند. از یک طرف، آنچه می‌تواند به لذت تماشای فیلم بیفزاید، وجود زیرنویسی روان به زبان مقصد است، زیرا بیننده علاوه بر بهرمندی از ترجمه، زبان اصلی فیلم را هم می‌شنود، و از طرف دیگر زیرنویس به دلیل محدودیت‌های کمی و کیفی خود، بستری مساعد برای راه یافتن برخی عناصر زبانی و فرهنگی التقاطی را به زبان مقصد فراهم می‌کند، که مترجم می‌تواند آگاهانه یا ناآگاهانه به این امر دامن بزند و بر میزان آن بیفزاید، که این امر خود ممکن است به پیدایش ترجمه‌ای نامفهوم بینجامد. هدف از این تحقیق جامع، پیدا کردن متداول‌ترین نمودهای التقاط زبانی و فرهنگی در زیرنویس فیلم است.

ب. مبانی نظری شامل مرور مختصری از منابع، چارچوب نظری و پرسش‌ها و فرضیه‌ها: با توجه به آنچه که در بالا ذکر شد، ابتدا این سؤال مطرح می‌شود که آیا اصلاً پدیده التقاط در ترجمه زیرنویس فیلم نمود پیدا می‌کند یا خیر؛ و در صورت ظاهر شدن، متداول‌ترین نمدها کدام‌اند؟ آیا از نوع فرهنگی هستند یا نوع زبانی؟ و فرضیه بدین قرار است: از آنجایی که پدیده التقاط در ترجمه کتبی ظهور پیدا کرده‌است، به نظر می‌رسد که این پدیده در ترجمه زیرنویس که یکی از شاخه‌های ترجمه سمعی- بصری است هم نمود یابد. در این تحقیق از طبقه‌بندی نمودهای التقاط که توسط ملانظر و پرهام در سال 2009 ارائه شد، به عنوان چهارچوب نظری استفاده گردید.

پ. روش تحقیق شامل تعریف مفاهیم، روش تحقیق، جامعه مورد تحقیق، نمونه‌گیری و روش‌های نمونه‌گیری، ابزار اندازه‌گیری، نحوه اجرای آن، شیوه گردآوری و تجزیه و تحلیل داده‌ها: تحقیق حاضر از نوع توصیفی، تحلیلی و پیکر‌بنیان است. پیکره موازی مورد استفاده شامل 10 فیلم به زبان انگلیسی بود که در مجموع حدود 2400 دقیقه فیلم به هر دو زبان انگلیسی و فارسی مورد بررسی قرار گرفت. این فیلم‌ها که محصول سال‌های 1997 تا 2011 هستند عبارتند از: سخنرانی پادشاه (2011)، نبرد تایتان‌ها (2010)، قوی سیاه (2010)، بخور، عبادت کن و عشق بورز (2010)، My Soul to Take (تا روح را تسخیر کنی) (2010)، 88 دقیقه (2007)، خانه روی برکه (2006)، چطور مردی را ده روزه از دست بدهیم (2003)، ارباب حلقه‌ها (پاران حلقه) (2001) و وکیل مدافع شیطان (1997). زیرنویس فارسی فیلم‌ها در هر یک از وی‌دی‌های مربوط موجود بود اما همه وی‌دی‌ها زیرنویس انگلیسی نداشتند، در نتیجه جهت یکدست بودن، زیرنویس‌های زبان مبدأ همگی از اینترنت و از یک سایت خاص دانلود شدند. واحد تحلیل در تحقیق حاضر از کلمه تا حتی پاراگراف متغیر بود، چراکه پدیده التقاط می‌تواند در غالب هر یک از این واحدهای زبانی نمود یابد. کلیه مراحل تحقیق شامل جمع‌آوری داده‌ها و طبقه‌بندی و تحلیل آنها به صورت دستی انجام گرفت و آمار داده‌های جمع‌آوری شده مربوط به هر فیلم در جدولی که متعلق به همان فیلم بود ارائه گردید و هر یک از نمودها با مقابله متن انگلیسی و ترجمه فارسی آن تحلیل شد. در پایان هم جدول‌هایی ارائه شد که آمارهای نهایی را شامل می‌شد.

ت. یافته‌های تحقیق: نتایج بدست‌آمده نشان داد که التقاط در ترجمه زیرنویس فیلم نمود پیدا می‌کند. همچنین یافته‌های تحقیق حاکی از آن بود که گروه «اسم و تاریخ» متداول‌ترین نمود التقاط در زیرنویس است و بخش اعظم عناصر التقاطی یافت‌شده از نوع فرهنگی هستند و «رابطه میان فرهنگی معاصر» هم عامل اصلی پیدایش این عناصر التقاطی محسوب می‌شود. در این تحقیق همچنین مشخص شد که دو گروه «واحد (اندازه‌گیری و پول)» و «شغل» هم باید به عنوان نمودهای التقاط به مدل فرهنگی ادغامی ملانظر و پرهام (2009) افزوده شوند.

ث. نتیجه‌گیری و پیشنهادها: ماهیت پدیده التقاط به گونه‌ایست که خصوصاً در زیرنویس مشکلاتی را ایجاد می‌نماید، چراکه به دلیل محدودیت‌های کمی و کیفی زیرنویس، دست مترجم برای التقاط‌زدایی باز نیست. درست است که پذیرش آن دسته از عناصر التقاطی به عنوان پیامد طبیعی رابطه میان فرهنگی معاصر امری اجتناب‌ناپذیر است، اگر ترجمه با دقت فراوان انجام شود مترجم می‌تواند دست کم از تعداد آن گروه از عناصر التقاطی که در نتیجه تداخل ناخواسته به‌وجود می‌آیند، بکاهد.

صحت اطلاعات مندرج در این فرم بر اساس محتوای پایان نامه و ضوابط مندرج در فرم را گواهی می‌نمایم.

رئیس کتابخانه:

نام استاد راهنما: دکتر حسین ملانظر

سمت علمی: استادیار

نام دانشکده: ادبیات فارسی و زبان‌های خارجی

Acknowledgements

I owe special thanks to Dr. Hussein Mollanazar, my advisor, whose constant supervision, helpful suggestions and generous help really encouraged me to fulfill this task. I am grateful to Dr. Gholamreza Tajvidi, my reader, as well, since his proofreading of the present thesis and his invaluable suggestions were of great assistance to me. I would like to acknowledge my appreciation to my kind professors, Dr. Farahzad, Dr. Mahmoodzadeh, Dr. Manafi and Dr. Sediqi, too, who let me learn as much as possible during my M.A. study in Allameh Tabataba'i University.

I am also beholden to my friend, Ms. Fatemeh Parham, whose advice I always enjoyed in my university years.

Last, but certainly not the least, my sincere gratitude, whole-heartedly, goes to my dear family for their love and never-ending support. Although I always express my feelings to them, I want to let them know, here, one more time how much I love them.

Abstract

As the possibility of the occurrence of hybridity in written translation was a heated discussion, it was not inconceivable to think about the occurrence of hybridity in subtitling, as a type of translation within the audiovisual family, as well. However, despite the important role of hybridity in movies as an instrument of globalization, the frequent types of manifestation through which hybridity was exhibited in subtitles were not clear. This study which was based on a quite large corpus of 2400 minutes of movies adopted the taxonomy of manifestations of hybridness developed by Mollanazar and Parham (2009) as its theoretical framework and aimed at finding frequent manifestations of hybridity, either linguistic or cultural, in subtitles. The findings indicated that "Name and Date" was the most frequent manifestation of hybridity; and the majority of the hybrid elements were cultural. Contemporary intercultural communication was also found to be the major factor in the production of these hybrid elements.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract	v
Table of Contents	vi
List of Tables, Charts and Figures	x
Chapter One	1
1. Introduction	2
1.1. Overview	2
1.2. Background of the Problem	3
1.3. Statement of the Problem.....	3
1.4. Significance of the Study	4
1.5. Purpose of the Study	4
1.6. Research Questions.....	5
1.7. Research Hypothesis.....	5
1.8. Theoretical Framework.....	5
1.9. Definition of Key Terms.....	6
1.10. Limitations and Delimitations of the Study	7
Chapter Two	8
2. Review of the Related Literature	9
2.1. Overview	9
2.2. Audiovisual Text	9
2.3. Audiovisual Translation.....	10
2.3.1. The History of Audiovisual Translation	11
2.3.2. Types of Audiovisual Translation.....	12
2.3.2.1. Subtitling.....	13
2.3.2.2. Revoicing	14
2.3.3. Different Tastes for Audiovisual Translation.....	15

2.4. Subtitling in Focus.....	16
2.4.1. Advantages and Disadvantages of Subtitling	16
2.4.2. Subtitling Methods	17
2.4.3. Subtitling Constraints.....	19
2.4.4. Subtitling Strategies	20
2.4.5. Types of Subtitling.....	23
2.4.6. Subtitling as an Instrument of Foreignization	24
2.4.7. Subtitling Standards	25
2.5. Culture.....	29
2.5.1. Cultural Repertoire.....	29
2.6. Contact	30
2.7. Interference	31
2.8. Hybridity	32
2.9. The Notion of Hybridity in Translation Studies	33
2.9.1. Hybridity as a feature of Contemporary Intercultural Communication.....	34
2.9.1.1. Manifestations of Hybridity as a Feature of Contemporary Intercultural Communication	36
2.9.1.2. Possible Settings for the Occurrence of Hybrid Texts as Features of Contemporary Intercultural Communication....	37
2.9.2. Hybridity as a Quality of the Contemporary Intercultural Identities Traceable in Original Writings.....	39
2.9.2.1. Manifestations of Hybridity as a Quality of the Contemporary Intercultural Identities Traceable in Original Writings	40
2.9.3. Hybridity as an Undesired Interference	42
2.9.3.1. Manifestations of Hybridity as an Undesired Interference	44
2.10. Dehybridization.....	44
2.11. Transitory Nature of a Hybrid Text.....	47

2.12. Functions of Hybrid Texts	48
2.13. Factors Enhancing Degree of Hybridity	50
2.14. Hybridity in Media	51
2.15. Hybridity in Subtitling	52
Chapter Three	53
3. Methodology	54
3.1. Overview	54
3.2. Research Type and Design	54
3.3. The Corpus	54
3.3.1. Selection Criteria	55
3.3.2. List of Movies	55
3.4. Rationale	57
3.5. Procedure	57
3.6. Data Collection and Classification	58
Chapter Four	70
4. Data Analysis and Findings	71
4.1. Overview	71
4.2. Data Analysis	71
4.2.1. Analysis of "The King's Speech"	71
4.2.2. Analysis of "Clash of the Titans"	76
4.2.3. Analysis of "Black Swan"	80
4.2.4. Analysis of "Eat Pray Love"	83
4.2.5. Analysis of "My Soul to Take"	85
4.2.6. Analysis of "88 Minutes"	87
4.2.7. Analysis of "The Lake House"	88
4.2.8. Analysis of "How to Lose a Guy in 10 Days"	90
4.2.9. Analysis of "The Lord of the Rings"	92
4.2.10. Analysis of "The Devil's Advocate"	93

4.3. Results and Findings.....	95
4.4. Discussion	103
Chapter Five	109
5. Conclusion.....	110
5.1. Overview	110
5.2. Research Questions Revisited.....	110
5.3. Conclusion.....	111
5.4. Pedagogical Implication.....	112
5.5. Suggestions for Further Research.....	113
References.....	115
Internet Film Databases.....	120
Filmiography.....	122
Appendices	123
Appendix I: The King's Speech	124
Appendix II: Clash of the Titans.....	130
Appendix III: Black Swan	134
Appendix IV: Eat Pray Love	137
Appendix V: My Soul to Take.....	144
Appendix VI: 88 Minutes.....	148
Appendix VII: The Lake House.....	152
Appendix VIII: How to Lose a Guy in 10 Days.....	156
Appendix IX: The Lord of the Rings	161
Appendix X: The Devil's Advocate	169

List of Tables, Charts and Figures

Tables and Charts

Table 3.1 List of Selected Movies and Related Information.....	56
Table 3.2 Taxonomy of Manifestations of Hybridity	59
Table 3.3 Mollanazar and Parham's Integrated Model of Culture (2009)	62
Table 4.1 Manifestations of Hybridity in "The King's Speech"	72
Table 4.2 Manifestations of Hybridity in "Clash of the Titans"	76
Table 4.3 Manifestations of Hybridity in "Black Swan"	81
Table 4.4 Manifestations of Hybridity in "Eat Pray Love"	84
Table 4.5 Manifestations of Hybridity in "My Soul to Take"	86
Table 4.6 Manifestations of Hybridity in "88 Minutes"	87
Table 4.7 Manifestations of Hybridity in "The Lake House"	88
Table 4.8 Manifestations of Hybridity in "How to Lose a Guy in 10 Days" ...	91
Table 4.9 Manifestations of Hybridity in "The Lord of the Rings"	92
Table 4.10 Manifestations of Hybridity in "The Devil's Advocate"	94
Table 4.11 Manifestations of Hybridity in the Subtitles of the 10 Movies Selected.....	96
Table 4.12 Manifestations of Hybridity in Form of the Two Cultural Elements of Unit and Job	97
Table 4.13 Manifestations of Hybridity: Their Frequency.....	100
Table 4.14 The Ratio of Cultural Hybridity to Linguistic Hybridity.....	102
Table 4.15 Labeling Extracted Hybrid Elements of the Present Study	103
Chart 4.1 Distribution of Manifestations of Hybridity in the 10 Movies Selected	101

Figures

Figure 3.1 Hofstede's Onion Model	63
Figure 3.2 Hall's Traid for the Iceberg Theory	65

Chapter One:

Introduction

1. Introduction

1.1. Overview

In today's world, people can communicate with each other very easily by means of different technologies which almost all are in the service of globalization. Among these, movie industry pushes itself to the scene as a powerful channel which affects this global communication to a great extent. Nowadays, people prefer to watch movies rather than reading books to know about their other peers dwelling in different parts of the world.

In such a situation, of different types of translation, the audiovisual one with its two branches of “subtitling” and “revoicing” (Karamitroglou, 2000, p. 4) has an important role, maybe even more important than that of written translation because it is what makes a movie understandable to those who are outside of the movie-maker country.

As Hatim (1997, p. 157) believes that the only way for people from different cultures to reach and understand one another is to be in “contact” and such a condition is just achievable by using texts, the focus of the present study is to search for hybrid elements as consequences of contact, in subtitling as it contains texts.

1.2. Background of the Problem

Homi Bhabha (1994), the Indian-American postcolonial theorist is considered as the initiator of the discussion about the phenomenon of hybridity. Following him, other scholars such as Schäffner and Adab (2001), Neubert (2001), Tirkkonen-Condit (2001), Pym (2001), Snell-Hornby (2001) and many others continued this trend. Hybridity remains a controversial issue, some scholars consider it as a common feature of all translations and some others label it as a common feature of some source texts. Recently, a comprehensive research is also done by Mollanazar and Parham (2009) who provided a taxonomy for manifestations of this phenomenon. Unfortunately, most of what has been found up to now was acquired by analyzing the area of written translation and the audiovisual branch almost remained unexplored.

1.3. Statement of the Problem

When we watch movies, we want to enjoy them as instruments which can either entertain us or give us information. In case of foreign movies, this enjoyment can be fulfilled if they get translated through subtitling, for in addition to hearing the complete original sound, one can refer to subtitles to become aware of what is going on in the movie. If we believe that “a hybrid postmodern world with an abundance of international and

intercultural communication by necessity creates hybrid texts” (Snell-Hornby, 2001, p. 215), we can conclude that audiovisual translation as a specific type of text cannot keep itself untouched by such a condition and hybridity will manifest itself in this type of text, too.

1.4. Significance of the Study

According to Ramiere (2006, para. 4), “one of the greatest challenges for a movie after its domestic release is reaching an international audience and being successful abroad”; regarding this fact, subtitling must play an important role in the process of internationalization. Via the process of subtitling, some cultural and linguistic elements may slide into the target text. Translators may be aware of such transfers and do it deliberately or they might be simply unaware. But it makes no difference, for in both conditions hybrid elements exist there in translation. Unfortunately, in spite of the importance of hybridity and its permanent existence in almost all translations, no special research had been done to investigate its nature and manifestations in subtitles.

1.5. Purpose of the Study

This study aimed at finding frequent manifestations of hybridity, either linguistic or cultural, in subtitles and determining to what kind the majority

of these hybrid elements belonged: hybridity as a feature of contemporary intercultural communication or hybridity as an undesired interference.

1.6. Research Questions

According to the purpose of the study, the following questions were put forth:

- Does hybridity occur in subtitles of movies translated from English into Persian?
- If so, what are the most frequent manifestations of this phenomenon?

1.7. Research Hypothesis

It was hypothesized that:

"Just as hybridity manifests itself in written translation, this phenomenon emerges in subtitles as a type of translated text belonging to the audiovisual family."

1.8. Theoretical Framework

The following taxonomy proposed by Mollanazar and Parham (2009) was used as the theoretical framework in this study. It is based on different scholars' approaches to hybridity.

- Hybridity as a feature of contemporary intercultural communication.

- Hybridity as a feature attributed to identity observable in texts produced in mixed sites of belonging; this type is merely observable in original writings but is transferable in translation.
- Hybridity as a pejorative quality showing the presence of undesired elements traceable merely in translations.
- Dehybridization as a process by which a hybrid element loses its hybrid character; this process operates on texts that are already hybrid in one of the three above-mentioned forms.

Each of these parts itself has various branches. In this study, the focus was just on numbers 1 and 3, for it was not intended to discuss here identity-related issues or the phenomenon of dehybridization.

1.9. Definition of Key Terms

- ***Audiovisual translation:*** “Audiovisual translation is what can also be referred to as screen translation. The term screen translation emphasizes the locative of the medium/carrier where the translation product appears, namely the TV, cinema or video screen.” (Karamitroglou, 2000, p. 1).
- ***Subtitles:*** “Subtitles, also referred to as captions, are translations of the spoken or written source text of the original into a written target text which is added to the original product usually at the bottom of

the screen” (Gottlieb, 1998, p. 147; Luyken et al., Delabastits, 1998, p. 200; cited in Karamitroglou, 2000, p. 5).

- **Hybrid text:** “A hybrid text is a text that results from a translation process. It shows features that somehow seem ‘out of place’/‘strange’/‘unusual’ for the receiving culture, i.e. the target culture.” (Schäffner & Adab, 2001a, p. 169).

1.10. Limitations and Delimitations of the Study

Despite the vast literature which exists about hybridity, nearly the whole part of it is developed by exploring written translation. So, in this research we encountered some difficulties due to the lack of practical works in the area of audiovisual translation.

The present study was also intended to investigate hybridity in subtitles and the dubbed movies were left out.

Chapter Two:

Review of the Related Literature

2. Review of the Related Literature

2.1. Overview

As it is clear from the title of the study, the two phenomena of subtitling and hybridity are dealt with here. In the first instance, audiovisual translation is discussed, of course, the main concentration is on subtitling. A brief history of movie translation is given and subtitling and its related issues are explored, thoroughly; then, hybridity is represented and discussed according to the three main approaches to this phenomenon in the field of translation studies. Different manifestations of this phenomenon are also reviewed.

It is a norm that at the final section, a relationship must be set up between the two under exploration phenomena, subtitling and hybridity in case of this study, but due to the lack of research on hybridity in audiovisual translation, this chapter does not entail such a section.

2.2. Audiovisual Text

If a text is “a speech act” or more broadly, “any instance of communication” then an audiovisual text is “a communication act involving sounds and images” (Zabalbeascoa, 2008, p. 21); or as Delabastita (1998; cited in Karamitroglou, 2000, p. 1) states “unlike communication through books, radio, telephone or sign language, audiovisual communication implies that both the acoustic channel through

air vibration and the visual channel through light waves are simultaneously utilized”.

Zabalbeascoa (2008, p. 24) considers four components for an audiovisual text:

- Verbal-audio signs including words which can be heard.
- Verbal-visual signs containing words which can be read.
- Nonverbal-audio signs involving music and special effects.
- Nonverbal-visual signs consisting of the pictures and photography.

In his idea, if the viewer brings his eyesight to look, watch and read the subtitles and images and his ears to listen to speeches, sounds and music, the text can satisfy the criteria of a “prototypical” audiovisual text (2008, p. 24).

2.3. Audiovisual Translation

Traditionally translated texts had their own specific clients who did not exceed that of “educated elite”; the subjects of such translations were mostly related to the areas of religion, literature, science and philosophy (Newman 1991; cited in Schwarz, 2002, Introduction, para. 1). This trend somehow changed during the “twentieth century” when texts with political and technical subjects got translated and to the population of target receivers, that of ordinary audiences was also added (Newman, 1991; cited