

**IN THE NAME OF ALLAH
THE BENEFICENT, THE MERCIFUL**



Allameh Tabataba'i University
Faculty of Persian Literature and Foreign Languages
Department of English Language and Literature

***Narrative Impact and EFL Children's
Self-concept/Identity:
A Cultural Study***

A Thesis
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of MA in
Teaching English as a Foreign Language
(TEFL)

Advisor: Dr. Fahimeh Marefat
Reader: Dr. Mohammad Khatib

By: Aram Pourdavoodi

Tehran, Iran
January, 2011



کتابخانه مرکزی و مرکز اسناد دانشگاه علامه طباطبائی

فرم گردآوری اطلاعات پایان نامه ها

عنوان: مطالعه فرهنگی تاثیر روایت در کتابهای آموزش زبان انگلیسی بر خودپنداره/هویت کودکان زبان آموز
نویسنده/محقق: آرام پورداودی
مترجم: -
استاد راهنما: سرکار خانم دکتر فهیمه معرفت استاد مشاور: جناب آقای دکتر محمد خطیب استاد داور: جناب آقای دکتر مهدی نوروزی خیابانی
کتابنامه: دارد واژه نامه: ندارد
نوع پایان نامه: <input type="checkbox"/> بنیادی <input type="checkbox"/> توسعه ای <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> کاربردی
مقطع تحصیلی: کارشناسی ارشد سال تحصیلی: 89-90
محل تحصیل: تهران نام دانشگاه: علامه طباطبائی دانشکده: ادبیات فارسی و زبانهای خارجی
تعداد صفحات: 119 گروه آموزشی: زبان و ادبیات انگلیسی
کلید واژه ها به زبان فارسی: هویت، خودپنداره، روایت، تقابل با دیگری، پسااستعماری
کلید واژه ها به زبان انگلیسی: identity, self-concept, narrative, Othering, postcolonialism

چکیده

الف. موضوع و طرح مسئله (اهمیت موضوع و هدف): در این رساله اثر روایت‌های یکی از کتب زبان انگلیسی رایج در ایران (سری چترباکس) بر خودپنداره/هویت کودکان زبان آموز بررسی شده است که معمولاً عاری از هرگونه ایدئولوژی در نظر گرفته می‌شوند.

ب. مبانی نظری شامل مرور مختصری از منابع، چارچوب نظری، پرسشها و فرضیه‌ها: در دیدگاه پساساختارگرایی زبان، سازنده‌ی هویت افراد محسوب می‌شود و روایت، واسطه فهم ما از جهان. در حالیکه فرایند سالم تشکیل هویت نیاز به ارتباط تعاملی با دیگران دارد، در حیطه آموزش زبان انگلیسی این رابطه کاملاً تقابلی و یک طرفه است. در چنین فضایی هویت کودکان تحت تاثیر ایدئولوژی تقابلی دیگری قرار می‌گیرد. روایتها به عنوان مهمترین محصول هر فرهنگ قادرند ایدئولوژیهای همراه خود را به شکلی کاملاً طبیعی و عادی جلوه دهند که برای خوانندگان قانع کننده باشد. در دوره نوجوانی که زمان شکل گیری هویت افراد است روایتها می‌توانند بیشترین تاثیر را روی مخاطب خود داشته باشند. در این رساله دو پرسش اصلی و شش زیرگروه مدنظر بوده است. ابتدا اثر روایت‌های چترباکس بر خودپنداره کلی کودکانی که حداقل دو سال این سری را خوانده بودند و سپس تاثیر آنها بر شش زیرگروه خودپنداره بررسی شد. در بخش دوم مکانیسم قرارگرفتن ایدئولوژی تقابلی دیگری در روایتها مورد تحقیق قرار گرفت.

پ. روش تحقیق شامل تعریف مفاهیم، روش تحقیق، جامعه مورد تحقیق، نمونه گیری و روشهای نمونه گیری، ابزار اندازه گیری، نحوه اجرای آن، شیوه گردآوری و تجزیه و تحلیل داده‌ها: 137 کودک ایرانی زبان آموز از هر دو جنس در این تحقیق شرکت کردند که حدوداً نیمی از آنها هنوز دوره چترباکس را شروع نکرده بودند. هر دو گروه به پرسشنامه سنجش خودپنداره کودکان پاسخ دادند. از میان آنها 36 نفر حذف شدند. از طریق آزمون مستقل تی میانگین دو گروه مورد مقایسه قرار گرفت. در بخش کیفی بر اساس مدل گریماس تقابلهای دوتایی بین شخصیت‌های همه داستانهای چترباکس در هر شش سطح تعیین شدند.

ت. یافته‌های تحقیق: خودپنداره کودکان گروه اول که به مدت دو سال در معرض روایت‌های چترباکس بودند نسبت به گروه دوم در حوزه ظاهر فیزیکی به طور معناداری تقلیل یافته بود. به عبارت دیگر زبان آموزان گروه دوم تصویری به مراتب بهتر از شکل ظاهری خود در ذهن داشتند. از طرفی ایدئولوژی تقابلی دیگری بیش از هرچیز در تفاوت ظاهری شخصیت‌های داستانها ظهور کرده بود که مویده نتایج بخش کمی این تحقیق محسوب می‌شد.

ث. نتیجه گیری و پیشنهادات: همزادپنداری با رابطه تقابلی "ما سفیدپوستان- شما خارجیها" در کودکان می‌تواند احساس حقارت در حیطه شکل ظاهری ایجاد کند، همان اتفاقی که بین استعمارگر و استعمار شده در گذشته روی می‌داد. از آنجا که در سایر محصولات هر فرهنگ چنین ایدئولوژی‌هایی در قالب روایت می‌تواند وجود داشته باشد، محقق پیشنهاد می‌کند که در کنار توجه دادن متولیان امر تهیه و تدوین کتب زبان کودکان و افزایش آگاهی معلمان به عاری نبودن داستانهای کودکان از ایدئولوژیهای فرهنگی، مهارتهای خواندن خلاقانه و انتقادی روایتها در کودکان زبان آموز تقویت شود.

صحت اطلاعات مندرج در این فرم بر اساس محتوای پایان نامه و ضوابط مندرج در فرم را گواهی می‌نمایم.

نام دانشکده:

سمت علمی:

نام استاد راهنما:

رئیس کتابخانه:

"We become that which we understandly [sic] behold and hear."

Coleridge (1804)

To the 137 kids of this study

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Mohammad Khatib, my Promethean Professor, for resurrecting the fire of literature in my mind and for allowances he made for me to find my path freely and enjoy every single moment I worked on this research, and for accepting to be the precious and dear reader of this study; Dr. Amir Ali Nojournian, from Shahid Beheshti University, for inspiring the original idea of this study; Dr. Nowruzi and Dr. Fahim for sharing their profound knowledge throughout my MA courses; Dr. Tajeddin for helping me clarify initially sweeping design of the present study; Dr. Ena Lee, from University of British Columbia, for providing me her article in *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication* that was not accessible to me; Mr. Hadi Hemmati for his generous comments, nudging my thinking forward; Iran Bakhshandeh Rostami, my best friend, for lending me her support in distributing the questionnaires of this study, surpassing the title of friendship; Maryam Adavoodi, my dear classmate, for her continued support; and, Elham, my dear sister, for shedding light on my path with sharing her own academic experiences.

I am deeply indebted to Dr. Fahimeh Marefat who has kindly agreed to be my advisor, and patiently help me in all the time of research for and writing of this thesis with her critical insights. Her constant smile and ongoing encouragement made this study possible.

I would also like to thank all the children participating in my study and all the scholars whom I have referred to throughout the study for extending my ideas. And special thanks remain due to my parents whose extraordinary patience and everyday support kept me motivated.

ABSTRACT

The present study assessed the impact of narrative content of *American Chatterbox* series on the self-concept/self-identity of child learners. The impact of language ideologies on students could not be simply ignored as Leonardo (2003) truly considered subjectivity as an effect of ideology. Unlike the existing Us-Them relations in the field of TEFL, a healthy process of identity construction requires dialogic relations between people in the social context. The sample consisted of 50 language learners studying *American Chatterbox* series for at least two years and 51 newcomers to three language institutes. The researcher drew on Karami's (2000) translated and adapted version of Ahluwalia's (1986) Children's Self-concept Scale (CSCS) to collect the quantitative data and analyzed it by the independent sample *t*-test procedure. Under the rubrics of Greimas' actant model, the binary oppositions between characters were established. The effect of Othering ideology was no more evident than in physical appearance of characters. The portrayal of opponent characters' physical appearance as Othered bodies echoed what Kamada (2010) called *the discourse of Other grotesqueness*. In line with findings of qualitative analysis of ideologically Otherized narrative content of the mentioned series, language learners had a significantly lower sense of self-concept on the domain of physical appearance and attributes (PHY) than newcomers: $t(86.46) = -2.12$, $sig.(2-tailed) = .04$, $\alpha = .05$. In a postcolonial sense, identifying with "Self-Other" relations between fictional characters may lead in a sense of owning Othered bodies on the part of child learners. These findings supported Hunt's (2005) assumption on readers' identities: "Readers are ideologically constructed by their identification with the character" (p. 42). What appeared to be emerging from this study, however, was a call for awareness of the interrelations among

the issues once approached separately, that is the liaison among narrative genre, ideology of Othering, and identity construction in EFL classrooms.

CONTENTS

Dedication.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Abstract	iii
List of tables	viii
List of figures	ix
List of abbreviations	x
List of appendices.....	xi

Chapter I: Introduction

1.1 Foreword	1
1.2 Statement of the problem	1
1.3 Significance of the study	2
1.4 Purpose of the study	4
1.5 Research questions	4
1.5.1 Quantitative Part.....	4
1.5.2 Qualitative Part.....	6
1.6 Research hypotheses	6
1.7 Limitations and delimitations	7
1.8 Definition of the key terms	9
1.8.1 Actant	9
1.8.2 Children Self-Concept Scale (CSCS).....	9
1.8.3 Narrative	10
1.8.4 Othering	10
1.8.5 Postcolonialism	10

Chapter II: Review of the Related Literature

2.1 Theoretical background	12
----------------------------------	----

2.1.1 Identity defined	12
2.1.2 Post-structuralism and identity	13
2.1.3 Identity construction	15
2.1.4 Otherness as a concept	17
2.1.5 Neo-colonialism and the concept of Othering	18
2.1.6 Critical theory (CT) perspective to applied linguistics.....	20
2.1.7 Ideology defined	22
2.1.8 Cultural hegemony of ELT industry	23
2.1.9 Narrative theory	27
2.1.9.1 Narrative impact	27
2.1.9.2 Narratives as ideological carriers.....	30
2.1.9.3 Otherness in narratives	33
2.1.9.4 Narratives for children	34
2.2 Previous research findings	36
Chapter III: Methodology	
3.1 Introduction	44
3.2 Participants.....	44
3.2.1 Language learners and newcomers	44
3.2.1.1 Demographic data of respondents	44
3.2.1.2 Identity or self-concept?	45
3.2.1.3 Why child adolescents?.....	47
3.2.2 <i>American Chatterbox</i> series	48
3.2.2.1 General description of the series	48
3.2.2.2 <i>American Chatterbox</i> series as children’s literature?.....	50
3.3 Instrumentation	52
3.3.1 Children’s Self-Concept Scale (CSCS)	52
3.3.1.1 Structure	52
3.3.1.2 Reliability and validity	53
3.3.1.3 Administration and scoring	54

3.3.2 Herman and Vervaeck's (2007) model.....	54
3.4 Data collection	60
3.5 Data analysis	61
Chapter IV: Results and Discussion	
4.1 Introduction	63
4.2 Quantitative part	63
4.3 Qualitative part	74
4.3.1 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox Starter</i>	74
4.3.2 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox 1</i>	77
4.3.3 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox 2</i>	77
4.3.4 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox 3</i>	80
4.3.5 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox 4</i>	81
4.3.6 Characters in <i>American Chatterbox 5</i>	87
Chapter V: Conclusions, implications, and suggestions for further studies	
5.1 Introduction	93
5.2 Conclusions.....	93
5.3 Pedagogical implications	93
5.3.1 Issues for teachers	93
5.3.2 Issues for students	94
5.3.3 Issues for material developers	96
5.4 Suggestions for further studies	97
References	98
Appendices	111

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 Descriptive Statistics of Groups 1 and 2.....	45
Table 3.2 Items Related to Each Subscale of Self-Concept Scale.....	53
Table 3.3 Lie Items of Self-Concept Scale.....	54
Table 4.1 Descriptive Comparison of <i>Mean</i> , <i>SD</i> , and <i>SEM</i> for Self-Concept Total Scale and Its Subscales between Groups 1 (language learners) and 2 (newcomers)	65
Table 4.2 Independent Samples <i>t</i> -Test for the Comparison between Groups 1 and 2 on Self-Concept Total Scale and Its Subscales	67
Table 4.3 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Starter</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model	75
Table 4.4 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Book 1</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model.....	78
Table 4.5 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Book 2</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model	79
Table 4.6 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Book 3</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model.....	81
Table 4.7 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Book 4</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model	82
Table 4.8 Character Distribution in <i>American Chatterbox Book 5</i> Based on Greimas' Actant Model	88

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Actants in Greimas' model (1983, as cited in Rimón-Kenan, 2002, p. 37)	59
Figure 4.1 Collectivist green monsters.....	76
Figure 4.2 White attractiveness (up) vs. Other grotesqueness (down)	80
Figure 4.3 Spider Smith, the opponent	83
Figure 4.4 Uncle John, Kate, Caroline, and Ken in ancient Egypt.....	84
Figure 4.5 The all-seeing Eye (Noreagaaa & Achernahr, 2008).....	85
Figure 4.6 Mort Cyannis and Gorrilla, the opponents	89

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BEH = behavioral adjustment

CSCS = Children Self-Concept Scale

EFL = English as a foreign language

FRE = freedom from anxiety

HAP = happiness and satisfaction

HOV = homogeneity of variance

INT = intellectual and school status

M = mean

p = probability level

PHY = physical appearance and attributes

POP = popularity

SD = standard deviation

SEM = standard error of the mean

TESOL = teaching English as a second language

TOT = total self-concept

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A. Ahluwalia's (1986) Children's Self-Concept Scale (CSCS)....	111
Appendix B. Karami's (2000) translated and culturally adapted version of Ahluwalia's Children's Self-Concept Scale (CSCS)	113
Appendix C. Table of critical values for t	119

Chapter One

Introduction

1.1 Foreword

Always I wonder why narratives continue to fascinate readers during the history of readership. After taking a course titled, Literature in Education in Shahid Beheshti University as a part of MA program, my lifelong questions had the chance of being answered. Then, in open classes of the Iranian Academy of Persian Language I've got more familiar with the realm of "narratology", especially through taking a course named, Narrative Theory. That was the departure point of the present study.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Whereas TESOL textbooks continue to use the English language as a cultural carrier of dominant ideologies, language materials for children are considered too "innocent" to teach cultural discriminations. Most of these textbooks use narratives as pedagogic tools for making language learning process more enjoyable and interesting. One can see this humanistic claim visually printed on the back cover of the textbooks for children, even in their accompanied teacher's books. However, the exposure of learners with cultural issues and the process of identity construction have started and almost finished before teachers allow them to learn them through language materials for adult learners.

Nowadays, in the literature of *narrative theory*, a new term for the field of narrotology, narratives are considered the most important product of each culture and naturally pregnant with assumptions, insights, ideologies, and so on (Gramsci, 1971, as cited in Herman & Vervaeck, 2007, p. 218).

Because the primary purpose of language textbooks in Iran is to teach English as a "foreign" language, as an outstanding issue, the dominant ideology of *Othering*—"Us-Them" relations based on racial stereotypes—

should be more taken into account. Several studies have been done in Iran on all the grades of *High School Language Textbooks*, *Pre-university English Textbook*, and *Interchange* series (Arezoumandi, 2005; Ghalijian Moghaddam, 2002; Kakavand, 2009; Sahragard & Davatgarzadeh, 2010) to show the underlying ideologies in these materials. The present study deals with a neglected area, that is, the domain of material development for children. Generally speaking, much of the work done on learner's identity has occurred without consideration of psychological models of identity development, which leaves unexamined some of the questions of how identity develops. On the other hand, identity researches on EFL language learners are rather orphaned, as Yihong, Yuan, Ying, and Yan (2007) proposed:

There seems to be an unstated assumption that learners' self-identity change is only relevant in English as a second language (ESL) context where target-culture exposures are abundant; self-identity change is unimportant or irrelevant in English as a foreign language (EFL) context. Consequently, research on linguistic outcomes is abundant, and research on non-linguistic outcomes is limited. (p. 134)

To bridge this research gap, the present study concerns with EFL readers' positions against the current text hegemony in the field.

1.3 Significance of the Study

Language is the most common form of social communication. Because of the nature of language as a social practice, language learning engages the identities of learners. Interest in identity categories and language learning is gaining momentum. *TESOL Quarterly* (2006) was devoted to the implications

of race as a form or site of oppression, but this is indicative of the previous neglect of the topic.

Because of the role of language in the formation of identities and its implication in ideologies, as Crookes (2009) noted, language teaching is considered as political as any other domain of education and even more. One particular use of language through which society seeks to exemplify its current values and ideologies is that of narratives.

Our life is replete with stories. From early childhood, we are exposed to other's narratives. As Nojournian (2009) argued, "Narratives as linguistic structures are the go-between human beings and the world" (p. 49). On the other hand, childhood is seen as the crucial formative period in the life of human beings. Therefore, on the basis of these narratives, the identities of vulnerable children, at least its socio-cultural part (ethnic and gendered), are constructed. To put this in a way closer to the purpose of present study, language learners reading narrative-based textbooks are not only learning a linguistic system, they are learning "a diverse set of socio-cultural practices, often best understood in the context of wider relations of power" (Norton & Toohey, 2002, p. 115).

Othering is an important issue for TESOL professionals to consider because it shapes perceptions about many of the issues that administrators and teachers face. As Palfreyman (2005) pointed out, these issues include classroom interaction, conceptions of what is to be taught and how it should be assessed, and the relative positioning of non-native and native-English-speaking teachers. In other words, with regard to the current text hegemony of ELT industry on ex-colonized countries, this study attempts at examining the impact of the ideology of racial Othering on EFL language learners.